	2
APPEARANCES:	
For the Plaintiffs:	PETER WEINBERGER, ESQ.,
	Spangenberg, Shibley & Liber Suite 1700
	1001 Lakeside Avenue, E Cleveland, OH 44114
	(216) 696-3232
For the Defendants:	BRIAN BOONE, ESQ.,
TOT the belefidants.	Alston & Bird - Charlotte Ste. 300
	Vantage South End 1120 South Tryon Street
	Charlotte, NC 28203-6818 (704) 444-1106
	GRETCHEN N. MILLER
	Greenberg Traurig - Chicago Ste. 3100
	77 West Wacker Drive Chicago, IL 60601
	(312) 456-6583
	JONATHAN G. COOPER Quinn Emanuel Urquhart &
	Sullivan Ste. 900
	1300 I Street NW Washington, DC 20005
	(202) 538-8000
	JOHN P. MCDONALD, ESQ., Locke Lord - Dallas
	Suite 2800 2200 Ross Avenue
	Dallas, TX 75201 (214) 740-8758

1	WEDNESDAY SESSION, MAY 22, 2024, AT 1:55 P.M.
2	JUDICIAL ASSISTANT: Judge, this is Helen. I
3	have the team on. I have everybody required on. I'll let
4	people in as they're straggling.
14:03:33 5	THE COURT: Do we have the Court Reporter?
6	JUDICIAL ASSISTANT: We do have a Court
7	Reporter, yes. We have a Court Reporter, Judge.
8	THE COURT: All right.
9	JUDICIAL ASSISTANT: Hey, Judge. You're
14:04:03 10	breaking up a little. I think I'll kick you out and bring
11	you back in.
12	THE COURT: All right.
13	JUDICIAL ASSISTANT: I'm just going to knock
14	you off, remove you, and you have to rejoin.
14:04:11 15	THE COURT: All right.
16	(Pause.)
17	THE COURT: Well, can everyone hear me? Can
18	the Court Reporter?
19	COURT REPORTER: Yes.
14:05:38 20	THE COURT: All right. Do we have everyone?
21	I'd like to have the client representatives identify
22	yourselves because I probably have not met you. All right?
23	Who do we have from the what law directors do we
24	have? If you could identify yourself and what city and
14:05:58 25	county.

corporation counsel for the City of Rochester, New York. THE COURT: All right. Welcome, Patrick. MR. CAMPOLIETO: Your Honor, John Campolieto, also from the City of Rochester. THE COURT: All right. Who do we have for the subdivisions? MR. COVER: Jeremy Cover. I'm the City attorney for the City of Independence, Missouri. THE COURT: All right. Good afternoon, Jeremy. MR. COVER: Good afternoon. Thank you. MR. GARVEY: Judge, this is Jack Garvey, the attorney for Lincoln County, and I'm waiting for their county counsel to get on line. THE COURT: You broke up. What what subdivision? MR. GARVEY: Lincoln County, Missouri. THE COURT: Okay. All right. That's three. Who's the fourth? MR. BRATTON: Judge, this is Nathan Bratton with Webb County. I'm general counsel. THE COURT: Okay. Good. All right. And then who do we have for OptumRx? MR. BOONE: Judge Polster, this is Brian Boone	1	MR. BEATH: Judge, this is Patrick Beath,
MR. CAMPOLIETO: Your Honor, John Campolieto, also from the City of Rochester. THE COURT: All right. Who do we have for the subdivisions? MR. COVER: Jeremy Cover. I'm the City attorney for the City of Independence, Missouri. THE COURT: All right. Good afternoon, Jeremy. MR. COVER: Good afternoon. Thank you. MR. CARVEY: Judge, this is Jack Garvey, the attorney for Lincoln County, and I'm waiting for their county counsel to get on line. THE COURT: You broke up. What what subdivision? MR. GARVEY: Lincoln County, Missouri. THE COURT: Okay. All right. That's three. Who's the fourth? MR. BRATTON: Judge, this is Nathan Bratton with Webb County. I'm general counsel. THE COURT: Okay. Good. All right. And then who do we have for OptumRx?	2	corporation counsel for the City of Rochester, New York.
also from the City of Rochester. THE COURT: All right. Who do we have for the subdivisions? MR. COVER: Jeremy Cover. I'm the City attorney for the City of Independence, Missouri. THE COURT: All right. Good afternoon, Jeremy. MR. COVER: Good afternoon. Thank you. MR. GARVEY: Judge, this is Jack Garvey, the attorney for Lincoln County, and I'm waiting for their county counsel to get on line. THE COURT: You broke up. What what subdivision? MR. GARVEY: Lincoln County, Missouri. THE COURT: Okay. All right. That's three. Who's the fourth? MR. BRATTON: Judge, this is Nathan Bratton with Webb County. I'm general counsel. THE COURT: Okay. Good. All right. And then who do we have for OptumRx?	3	THE COURT: All right. Welcome, Patrick.
THE COURT: All right. Who do we have for the subdivisions? MR. COVER: Jeremy Cover. I'm the City attorney for the City of Independence, Missouri. THE COURT: All right. Good afternoon, Jeremy. MR. COVER: Good afternoon. Thank you. MR. GARVEY: Judge, this is Jack Garvey, the attorney for Lincoln County, and I'm waiting for their county counsel to get on line. THE COURT: You broke up. What what subdivision? MR. GARVEY: Lincoln County, Missouri. THE COURT: Okay. All right. That's three. Who's the fourth? MR. BRATTON: Judge, this is Nathan Bratton with Webb County. I'm general counsel. THE COURT: Okay. Good. All right. And then who do we have for OptumRx?	4	MR. CAMPOLIETO: Your Honor, John Campolieto,
7 Who do we have for the subdivisions? 8 MR. COVER: Jeremy Cover. I'm the City 9 attorney for the City of Independence, Missouri. 14:06:37 10 THE COURT: All right. Good afternoon, 11 Jeremy. 12 MR. COVER: Good afternoon. Thank you. 13 MR. GARVEY: Judge, this is Jack Garvey, the 14 attorney for Lincoln County, and I'm waiting for their 14:06:30 15 county counsel to get on line. 16 THE COURT: You broke up. What what 17 subdivision? 18 MR. GARVEY: Lincoln County, Missouri. 19 MR. GARVEY: Lincoln County, Missouri. 19 THE COURT: Okay. All right. That's three. 14:07:05 20 Who's the fourth? 21 MR. BRATTON: Judge, this is Nathan Bratton 22 with Webb County. I'm general counsel. 23 THE COURT: Okay. Good. All right. 24 And then who do we have for OptumRx?	14:06:17 5	also from the City of Rochester.
MR. COVER: Jeremy Cover. I'm the City attorney for the City of Independence, Missouri. THE COURT: All right. Good afternoon, Jeremy. MR. COVER: Good afternoon. Thank you. MR. GARVEY: Judge, this is Jack Garvey, the attorney for Lincoln County, and I'm waiting for their county counsel to get on line. THE COURT: You broke up. What what subdivision? MR. GARVEY: Lincoln County, Missouri. MR. GARVEY: Lincoln County, Missouri. THE COURT: Okay. All right. That's three. Who's the fourth? MR. BRATTON: Judge, this is Nathan Bratton with Webb County. I'm general counsel. THE COURT: Okay. Good. All right. And then who do we have for OptumRx?	6	THE COURT: All right.
attorney for the City of Independence, Missouri. THE COURT: All right. Good afternoon, If Jeremy. MR. COVER: Good afternoon. Thank you. MR. GARVEY: Judge, this is Jack Garvey, the attorney for Lincoln County, and I'm waiting for their county counsel to get on line. THE COURT: You broke up. What what subdivision? MR. GARVEY: Lincoln County, Missouri. THE COURT: Okay. All right. That's three. Who's the fourth? MR. BRATTON: Judge, this is Nathan Bratton with Webb County. I'm general counsel. THE COURT: Okay. Good. All right. And then who do we have for OptumRx?	7	Who do we have for the subdivisions?
THE COURT: All right. Good afternoon, Jeremy. MR. COVER: Good afternoon. Thank you. MR. GARVEY: Judge, this is Jack Garvey, the attorney for Lincoln County, and I'm waiting for their county counsel to get on line. THE COURT: You broke up. What what subdivision? MR. GARVEY: Lincoln County, Missouri. THE COURT: Okay. All right. That's three. Who's the fourth? MR. BRATTON: Judge, this is Nathan Bratton with Webb County. I'm general counsel. THE COURT: Okay. Good. All right. And then who do we have for OptumRx?	8	MR. COVER: Jeremy Cover. I'm the City
MR. COVER: Good afternoon. Thank you. MR. GARVEY: Judge, this is Jack Garvey, the attorney for Lincoln County, and I'm waiting for their county counsel to get on line. THE COURT: You broke up. What what subdivision? MR. GARVEY: Lincoln County, Missouri. THE COURT: Okay. All right. That's three. Who's the fourth? MR. BRATTON: Judge, this is Nathan Bratton with Webb County. I'm general counsel. THE COURT: Okay. Good. All right. And then who do we have for OptumRx?	9	attorney for the City of Independence, Missouri.
MR. COVER: Good afternoon. Thank you. MR. GARVEY: Judge, this is Jack Garvey, the attorney for Lincoln County, and I'm waiting for their county counsel to get on line. THE COURT: You broke up. What what subdivision? MR. GARVEY: Lincoln County, Missouri. MR. GARVEY: Lincoln County, Missouri. THE COURT: Okay. All right. That's three. Who's the fourth? MR. BRATTON: Judge, this is Nathan Bratton with Webb County. I'm general counsel. THE COURT: Okay. Good. All right. And then who do we have for OptumRx?	14:06:37 10	THE COURT: All right. Good afternoon,
MR. GARVEY: Judge, this is Jack Garvey, the attorney for Lincoln County, and I'm waiting for their county counsel to get on line. THE COURT: You broke up. What what subdivision? MR. GARVEY: Lincoln County, Missouri. THE COURT: Okay. All right. That's three. Who's the fourth? MR. BRATTON: Judge, this is Nathan Bratton with Webb County. I'm general counsel. THE COURT: Okay. Good. All right. And then who do we have for OptumRx?	11	Jeremy.
attorney for Lincoln County, and I'm waiting for their county counsel to get on line. THE COURT: You broke up. What what subdivision? MR. GARVEY: Lincoln County, Missouri. THE COURT: Okay. All right. That's three. Who's the fourth? MR. BRATTON: Judge, this is Nathan Bratton with Webb County. I'm general counsel. THE COURT: Okay. Good. All right. And then who do we have for OptumRx?	12	MR. COVER: Good afternoon. Thank you.
county counsel to get on line. THE COURT: You broke up. What what subdivision? MR. GARVEY: Lincoln County, Missouri. THE COURT: Okay. All right. That's three. Who's the fourth? MR. BRATTON: Judge, this is Nathan Bratton with Webb County. I'm general counsel. THE COURT: Okay. Good. All right. And then who do we have for OptumRx?	13	MR. GARVEY: Judge, this is Jack Garvey, the
THE COURT: You broke up. What what 17 subdivision? 18 MR. GARVEY: Lincoln County, Missouri. 19 THE COURT: Okay. All right. That's three. 14:07:05 20 Who's the fourth? 21 MR. BRATTON: Judge, this is Nathan Bratton 22 with Webb County. I'm general counsel. 23 THE COURT: Okay. Good. All right. 24 And then who do we have for OptumRx?	14	attorney for Lincoln County, and I'm waiting for their
subdivision? MR. GARVEY: Lincoln County, Missouri. THE COURT: Okay. All right. That's three. Who's the fourth? MR. BRATTON: Judge, this is Nathan Bratton with Webb County. I'm general counsel. THE COURT: Okay. Good. All right. And then who do we have for OptumRx?	14:06:50 15	county counsel to get on line.
MR. GARVEY: Lincoln County, Missouri. THE COURT: Okay. All right. That's three. Who's the fourth? MR. BRATTON: Judge, this is Nathan Bratton With Webb County. I'm general counsel. THE COURT: Okay. Good. All right. And then who do we have for OptumRx?	16	THE COURT: You broke up. What what
THE COURT: Okay. All right. That's three. Who's the fourth? MR. BRATTON: Judge, this is Nathan Bratton with Webb County. I'm general counsel. THE COURT: Okay. Good. All right. And then who do we have for OptumRx?	17	subdivision?
14:07:05 20 Who's the fourth? 21 MR. BRATTON: Judge, this is Nathan Bratton 22 with Webb County. I'm general counsel. 23 THE COURT: Okay. Good. All right. 24 And then who do we have for OptumRx?	18	MR. GARVEY: Lincoln County, Missouri.
MR. BRATTON: Judge, this is Nathan Bratton with Webb County. I'm general counsel. THE COURT: Okay. Good. All right. And then who do we have for OptumRx?	19	THE COURT: Okay. All right. That's three.
with Webb County. I'm general counsel. THE COURT: Okay. Good. All right. And then who do we have for OptumRx?	14:07:05 20	Who's the fourth?
THE COURT: Okay. Good. All right. And then who do we have for OptumRx?	21	MR. BRATTON: Judge, this is Nathan Bratton
24 And then who do we have for OptumRx?	22	with Webb County. I'm general counsel.
	23	THE COURT: Okay. Good. All right.
MR. BOONE: Judge Polster, this is Brian Boone	24	And then who do we have for OptumRx?
	14:07:28 25	MR. BOONE: Judge Polster, this is Brian Boone

1	for OptumRx and United. We have Kate Mihalevich, who is the
2	General Counsel
3	THE COURT: You're breaking up.
4	MR. BOONE: Sorry.
14:07:38 5	THE COURT: Who's that?
6	MR. BOONE: Can everybody else hear me?
7	THE COURT: Yeah, now.
8	Who's the General Counsel?
9	MR. BOONE: Kate Mihalevich.
14:07:53 10	MS. MIHALEVICH: Good afternoon, Judge. This
11	is Kate Mihalevich. Can you hear me okay?
12	THE COURT: Yes, yes.
13	MS. MIHALEVICH: My apologies. My camera's
14	not working.
14:08:03 15	THE COURT: That's okay.
16	MR. BOONE: And also John I'm sorry. John
17	Kokkinen, Senior Associate for OptumRx.
18	THE COURT: All right. Welcome, John. All
19	right.
14:08:14 20	And who do we have for Express Scripts?
21	MR. COOPER: Your Honor, for Express
22	Scripts and I'll have them introduce themselves as well
23	we have Urmila Baumann, who's the Chief Counsel for
24	Legal, as well as Ashley Rothe, who helps oversee this
14:08:30 25	matter.

1 MS. BAUMANN: Good afternoon, your Honor. 2 THE COURT: Who is the first person? I didn't 3 get the last name? 4 MS. BAUMANN: Your Honor, my last name is 14:08:41 5 Baumann, B-A-U-M-A-N-N. 6 THE COURT: All right. Thank you. Okay. 7 I had -- I requested that we get together because what 8 I feared happening a few months ago has happened. And this 9 litigation between the subdivisions and the PBMs is starting 14:09:12 10 to degenerate into a hockey ball rather than a professional 11 litigation. And that's different than the way things have 12 gone in this MDL for six plus years. 13 And I had warned the parties I didn't think this was a 14 good road to go down, this motion to, you know, recuse or 14:09:38 15 disqualify Motley Rice. I said if the Defendants OptumRx 16 persisted in this, things will degenerate. That seems to 17 have happened. So it's my job to change the paradigm, and 18 I'm changing it right now. 19 So I make it clear I do not want to be spending my 14:10:05 20 time and the time of my valuable team dealing with motions 21 for protective orders, motions for sanctions, all these 22 motions to dismiss individual Defendants. All right? If 23 the parties insist that I do, and I determine that anyone 24 has, you know, needlessly complicated, protracted, whatever 14:10:34 25 this MDL, I will impose very hefty sanctions on the lawyers

involved and the clients involved, both. And, you know,
it's -- but if it's required, I've got as hard an edge as
anyone and I know how to use it, and I will do it. I don't
want to. But I don't want there to be any question in
anyone's mind about my ability and willingness to use it.
We're also going to start having regular conferences,

We're also going to start having regular conferences, and this one would have been in person but there was no way to do it quickly in person. We will be meeting about once a month, and it will be in person in Cleveland, and I'm doing this for a number of reasons.

It's very easy to demonize people and weaponize things on Zoom. It's a lot harder when you're in person when you know each other. So I want the lawyers to get to know each other and, more importantly, I want the clients to get to know each other.

Clients think that the lawyers aren't proceeding in this litigation the way they want them to, although later they tell the lawyers to do things differently or make the change, that's how it works. The clients are driving the train. And I want the clients to get to know each other.

So we're going to start off with what should be simple in this -- you know, is where we just ended the last conference on. All right?

I had -- we have this motion. I think it's primarily OptumRx. I don't know, eight or ten different OptumRx

14:11:20 10

14:10:58 5

2.

14:11:36 15

14:11:51 20

14:12:13 25

entities that have been named, and OptumRx filed a motion to dismiss some.

All right. There's some background so put yourself on mute, someone or everyone if you're not talking.

I asked Special Master Cohen to work with parties to just work this out. I didn't want to be spending my time.

For some reason, this didn't -- file -- involved Walgreen's, Wal-Mart, CVS. The Plaintiffs had sued a bunch of entities for each of those. I said look, no one's going to be dealing with all these separate entities in the trial. It's all things Wal-Mart, CVS. You work it out. All right?

They worked it out and the simple way to work it out is, I guess, either a number of those entities will dismiss, dismiss without prejudice, with the simple agreement that if there was a judgment, it would get paid. That's all the Plaintiffs care about. If they win, they get their judgment paid. If they lose, one entity or 20 entities for a given Defendant, they lose.

So no one's going to spend any time and I -- so I assume that if we have a trial for any of these four cases, we're not going to have the lawyers for the Plaintiffs or the Defendants spending the first half an hour or an hour of their opening statement trying to explain to the jury all of these and how the entities should --

MR. WEINBERGER: I'm sorry to interrupt.

14:12:37 5

7

8

6

1

2.

3

4

9

14:13:02 10

11

12

13

14

14:13:19 15

16

17

18

19

14:13:37 20

21

22

23

24

14:14:04 25

1	MR. BOONE: This is Brian you keep cutting
2	out for me. I can't hear what you're saying, your Honor.
3	THE COURT: Well, all right. I'll stop and
4	reconvene tomorrow in Cleveland. All right?
14:14:22 5	DEPUTY CLERK: Your Honor, this is Corey. I
6	can't he's it's hard for me, too.
7	THE COURT: Well, Helen, can you fix this?
8	JUDICIAL ASSISTANT: All I can do is hang
9	on, hang on.
14:14:34 10	It's Helen. This is Helen, the assistant. Judge,
11	please let me talk for one minute.
12	THE COURT: Yes.
13	JUDICIAL ASSISTANT: It's your computer. Your
14	signal is a little low, I think. I'm going to kick you out
14:14:46 15	again and have you rejoin.
16	I know it's a pain. It's about all I can do from
17	here. So here we go.
18	THE COURT: Get IT on. They can help.
19	SPECIAL MASTER: Judge, let me suggest
14:15:02 20	something.
21	Judge, if you turn your video off, it will often help
22	the connection because it's just a bandwidth issue and
23	everyone will still be able to hear what you say.
24	DEPUTY CLERK: Can we also ask anyone who's
14:15:15 25	not planning on speaking to mute their video? That's the

1	point, David. That will help.
2	If you're NOT planning on speaking, and you don't
3	mind, please turn your video off as well so we can lessen
4	the blow here.
14:15:37 5	JUDICIAL ASSISTANT: Judge had actually
6	dropped off and that wasn't me. He did it all on his own.
7	So when he does that, we can tell him to turn off his video.
8	SPECIAL MASTER: Thank you, Helen.
9	JUDICIAL ASSISTANT: Judge, this is Helen.
14:15:58 10	Can you hear me?
11	THE COURT: Yeah, I can hear you. I have a
12	problem. Can people hear me?
13	JUDICIAL ASSISTANT: Judge, turn off your
14	video if that if that helps. Let's see if that helps.
14:16:14 15	THE COURT: Okay. Just
16	JUDICIAL ASSISTANT: You got it, Judge. Try
17	talking.
18	THE COURT: All right.
19	JUDICIAL ASSISTANT: Okay.
14:16:25 20	THE COURT: Can people hear me now?
21	SPECIAL MASTER: Judge, it's a little choppy,
22	but I think you should go ahead.
23	THE COURT: Well, folks we'll have to
24	reconvene in person or somewhere else.
14:16:44 25	Helen, could someone in the office, can they get IT to

1	help with this?
2	JUDICIAL ASSISTANT: We can try, Judge. I
3	just don't think that anyone
4	THE COURT: Who on my staff is in the office
14:16:56 5	here?
6	SPECIAL MASTER: Judge, this is David. I can
7	help this way.
8	If you hang up, I will call you, and you can run it
9	through my cellphone and that will work. Obviously you
14:17:10 10	won't have video but it will work.
11	THE COURT: I don't.
12	SPECIAL MASTER: So
13	THE COURT: I'd rather see people but all
14	right.
14:17:25 15	SPECIAL MASTER: Okay.
16	You can even leave it running, Judge, but if you run
17	it through you can leave your Zoom running and see
18	people, and I'll call you on your phone, your cellphone, and
19	you can run it that way.
14:17:38 20	JUDICIAL ASSISTANT: That's a great idea,
21	David. Thank you.
22	THE COURT: All right.
23	JUDICIAL ASSISTANT: Judge, you can turn your
24	camera on if you want and I can mute you.
14:17:52 25	THE COURT: Well, it says you disabled my

1	video, so.
2	JUDICIAL ASSISTANT: Okay. That was
3	DEPUTY CLERK: That was me, not Helen, Judge.
4	I can hear you fine now.
14:18:05 5	THE COURT: All right.
6	SPECIAL MASTER: Can you hear me?
7	THE COURT: Yes. The question is whether I
8	should turn the sound off on my computer.
9	SPECIAL MASTER: You should. Turn it off on
14:18:19 10	your computer.
11	THE COURT: All right.
12	JUDICIAL ASSISTANT: David, we cannot hear the
13	Judge.
14	SPECIAL MASTER: Parties, can you hold just a
14:18:48 15	moment? I'm going to give the phone number to call.
16	JUDICIAL ASSISTANT: David, can you tell him
17	I'll fax him a phone number to call?
18	MR. FARRELL: This is Paul Farrell.
19	If he's on a laptop or fixed station, he might be able
14:19:18 20	to move where he has better reception.
21	JUDICIAL ASSISTANT: Yeah. I just don't know
22	if he knows where that is in his house but he always works
23	from where he is right now. So I don't know if it will get
24	better anywhere else.
14:19:50 25	THE COURT: All right. I just did it. Can

1 people -- well, I'm just going to go ahead. If not, we'll 2. do these in person. 3 So we were talking about all these various entities. 4 Okay. I mean we -- everyone knows that there is a trial. 14:20:24 5 We're not going to be worrying about all these different 6 entities for OptumRx and Express Scripts. It's going to be OptumRx or OptumRx RX and Express group. And that's how the 7 8 witnesses will refer to the corporation, that's how the 9 Judge will, that's how the lawyers will, and the jury 14:20:41 10 instructions, and the verdict forms. All right? 11 And so why -- we worked this out very easily in Track 12 3. Why are we still wasting time on this now? Can someone 13 explain to me? 14 MR. WEINBERGER: Well, your Honor, I'll be 14:21:09 15 happy -- on behalf of the Plaintiffs, in response to the --16 in response to our motion, jurisdictional motion to dismiss, 17 the very last exhibit, which I think is Exhibit F, contains 18 our proposed stipulations and I think would have solved this 19 issue entirely. And we put that proposal --14:21:37 20 THE COURT: What is -- what is the proposed 21 stipulation?

MR. WEINBERGER: So it's -- actually we filed it as a separate supplemental pleading shortly after our response to file the motion to -- response to motion to dismiss.

22

23

24

14:21:57 25

1 So it's on the docket. We don't have a docket number 2. for it but --3 THE COURT: Well, all right. 4 MR. WEINBERGER: -- I filed. 14:22:07 5 But the fact is we proposed a stipulation that does 6 exactly what it is that you want, and what it is that we 7 need, and it's been out there for about three weeks or more. 8 The Defendants said they intended to respond to it but 9 they haven't. 14:22:31 10 THE COURT: All right. Well why haven't the 11 Defendants responded? 12 MR. COOPER: Judge Polster, this is Jonathan 13 Cooper for the Express Scripts Defendants. 14 We have a counter proposal we've been vetting with our 14:22:47 15 client and expect to be able to send it this week. There 16 are certain issues about why certain Express Scripts 17 entities cannot be collapsed into one another. A key one, 18 just as an example -- there are others, but just as an 19 example, there are certain Express Scripts entities that are 14:23:03 20 dispensers and subject to the Controlled Substances Act and 21 there are others that are not. 22 So if they were all to be collapsed into a single 23 company, that would be subjecting certain entities to legal 2.4 duties that they don't actually have. So there are certain 14:23:21 25 things need to work out in the proposal and will be

1 following up with the Plaintiffs about that this week. 2. THE COURT: Well, we can -- again, the issue 3 is satisfying any judgment, all right, or any written 4 injunctive relief. All right? That's all we're talking 14:23:36 5 about. I mean that's the Plaintiffs' concern. We just --6 MR. COOPER: That may be the Plaintiffs' 7 concern -- sorry. I didn't mean to speak over you, sir. 8 THE COURT: But so -- all right. There's ways 9 to work this out. So all right. What about --14:23:53 10 MR. WEINBERGER: Your Honor, the document 11 filed was Document 5450. It has the proposed stipulation. 12 THE COURT: 4540? All right. Fine. 13 MR. WEINBERGER: 5450. 14 THE COURT: 5450. All right fine. 14:24:09 15 Is OptumRx going to respond to the response? 16 MR. BOONE: Your Honor, this is Brian Boone 17 for OptumRx and United. 18 And we're working on a counter proposal. 19 THE COURT: All right. 14:24:24 20 Well I want this done or else the Court's going to do it. Okay? And you may not know -- no one may be happy how 21 22 I do it. But trust me, no one is going to be -- it's hard 23 enough for a jury to understand they have to figure out four 2.4 or five different identities and four or five separate 14:24:44 25 Express groups identities, they won't get beyond that.

1 They'll be bald at the opening statement and it will get 2. worse, and we have enough smart people who know this. 3 So again, you know, if the lawyers can't solve it, 4 then I want the clients to solve it. And if no one will 14:25:02 5 solve it, the Court will get it done. All right? 6 So I'm not going to spend any more time on, you know, 7 motion to dismiss various entities. Okay? 8 MR. BOONE: Judge Polster, this is Brian Boone again. 9 14:25:16 10 THE COURT: You can't resolve it, there would 11 have to be a whole lot of expensive discovery on each and 12 every one of these entities before you can ultimately 13 determine factually what the evidence is against any of 14 them. 14:25:31 15 Again, this is going to be done. All right? So the 16 clients understand you're to get it done. If the lawyers 17 can't, you're to get it done or else I'm going to get it 18 done and no one may be happy how I'll get it done. 19 MR. BOONE: Judge Polster, this is Brian Boone 14:25:47 20 again for OptumRx and United. 21 I just want to make sure I understand you. When you 22 say get it done, what do you mean by that? Do you mean the 23 dismissal of the non-entities? 24 THE COURT: Why don't you -- why don't you talk to everyone else on the Zoom afterwards. Okay? When a 14:25:59 25

1 Federal Judge says the parties don't do it, the Court will 2. do it, that should be clear. All right? If it's not, well 3 I suggest you ask someone else because my quess is every 4 single person on this Zoom besides you understands what I 14:26:25 5 just said. All right? Now I also don't want to be, you know, spending a lot 6 of time, you know -- I was very clear in April what I said 7 8 the Defendants had to do in their discovery obligations. All right? They're to do it. 14:26:51 10 It's also clear the CMO said that there were -- each 11 side got a certain amount of interrogatory requests for 12 depositions, whatever. All right? 13 If a given party feels that that wasn't sufficient, 14 and you think you need more, you try and work it out with the other side. And if you think the other side's being 14:27:07 15 16 unreasonable, all right, then you got to ask the Court 17 permission to exceed the limits. Everyone understands that. 18 So I'm going to put a pause on this briefing on the 19 motion for sanctions and motions for protective orders and 14:27:29 20 direct the lawyers to sit down as professionals. 21 can't do it by Zoom, go to some city together and work it 22 out like good lawyers do. All right? 23 And if the lawyers can't, then I want -- we got the

clients on here. I want them to take control. I want this

litigation to start running professionally.

24

14:27:51 25

2.

14:29:39 25

14:29:23 20

14:29:05 15

14:28:22 5

14:28:47 10

There are -- there's some substantive motions to dismiss, based on -- well, I guess limitation and whether there's not -- there's a monetary loss, whatever, I'll have to deal with those in the briefs. But this other stuff, you all know how to work things through, and I'm going to give you one more chance to do it because I have to start doing it. It's going to end up being very expensive for some of the lawyers and some clients. I will, of course, have to do it if I'm given no choice but no one's going to be happy with the outcome.

So, you know, again, I want your clients to start having, you know, skin in the game. And so, you know, you're taking your time and your money to travel to Cleveland but more importantly, I want people to start getting to know each other. And if you've got something to say or some problem, then you sit down and you work it through. Okay?

We used to do it that way. Obviously, everyone knows the most important things that ever happen in a court hearing or conference or whatever is not what happens in with the Judge. It's before and afterward, 90 percent of what needs to get done, and that's when it gets done. When you see each other, you talk to people. All right?

And we've lost that with Zoom. So now that we can get back together again, we're going to do it. And it's clear

1 we need it with this litigation. So we're going to start 2. doing this. So I'm proposing, you know, about a month from now, 3 4 Tuesday, June 25th, at 3:00 P.M., and then I want a joint 14:29:58 5 status court Monday June the 24th at noon. And you don't need to file the report on the public docket. You just 6 7 e-mail it to the Court. And I think that's --8 MR. WEINBERGER: Your Honor, the -- your 9 Honor, the 25th is -- just checking the calendar. 14:30:27 10 THE COURT: Tuesday, the 25th. 11 MR. WEINBERGER: Okav. 12 THE COURT: About a month from now. 13 MR. WEINBERGER: Yeah, okay. 14 THE COURT: At 3:00 P.M. and spend an hour or 14:30:38 15 two working through whatever we've got. And mainly, I think 16 some personal face-to-face contact will be beneficial for 17 everyone in this litigation. And I want to get this back on 18 an even keel. All right? 19 I mean I had monthly meetings in this MDL at the 14:31:01 20 beginning, and they were helpful, helpful to the Court. 21 I think everyone got to know each other. We obviously four 22 years ago put a pause on all sorts of public meetings. And 23 I haven't felt the need to resume them until now. But we'll 24 do it, litigation with the PBMs. All right. 14:31:29 25 That's really pretty much what I had to say. But the

1 floor is now open for anyone from the Plaintiffs' side or 2. from OptumRx or Express Scripts. Any of the clients want to 3 say anything? 4 MR. COVER: Judge, this is Jeremy Cover with 14:32:04 5 the City of Missouri. Can you please clarify who you would 6 expect to see on the 25th at 3:00 P.M.? 7 THE COURT: The people we've got on -- the 8 people we have now. 9 These are -- you know, I've got lead counsel of each 14:32:24 10 of the four subdivisions, I mean four bellwethers. I've got 11 some representation from PEC. I've got the -- I think I 12 asked for the chief legal officer from each of the 13 subdivisions and the general counsel or some equivalent for 14 the two corporate Defendants. I figured, you know, I count 14:32:45 15 them as the clients. I could have gotten CEO's, mayors, or 16 county executives, but I don't need -- you know, I want the 17 people who are, who I believe are, from the clients' 18 standpoint, are overseeing the litigation. 19 If I was wrong with that, I mean I'm assuming the law 14:33:05 20 director or chief legal officer of the city or county is the 21 right person and, you know, the corporate representatives, I 22 assume I've got the right people. If I've got the wrong 23 people, then you've got to figure -- you know, let me know 24 and send the right people.

MR. COVER: Thank you, sir.

14:33:23 25

1 THE COURT: Okay. 2 Any -- I don't want to be accused of, you know, not 3 letting anyone speak. I mean I want everyone to hear from 4 me, but I want everyone to have the opportunity to address 14:33:47 5 anything they want with me or anyone else. Okay. 6 Thank you very much and have a good afternoon. 7 (Proceedings adjourned at 2:34 p.m.) CERTIFICATE 8 9 I certify that the foregoing is a correct 10 transcript from the record of proceedings in the 11 above-entitled matter. 12 13 14 15 s/Shirle Perkins Shirle M. Perkins, RDR, CRR 16 U.S. District Court - Room 7-189 801 West Superior Avenue 17 Cleveland, Ohio 44113 (216) 357-7106 18 19 20 21 22 23 24 25