

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
NORTHERN DISTRICT OF OHIO  
EASTERN DIVISION

**IN RE: NATIONAL PRESCRIPTION  
OPIATE LITIGATION**

**THIS DOCUMENT RELATES TO:**

*City of Rochester v. Purdue Pharma, L.P.*, No. 19-  
op-45853 (Track 12)

*Lincoln County v. Richard S. Sackler, M.D.*, No.  
20-op-45069 (Track 13)

*City of Independence, Missouri v. Williams*, No. 19-  
op-45371 (Track 14)

*County of Webb, Texas v. Purdue Pharma, L.P.*, No.  
18-op-45175 (Track 15)

**MDL NO. 2804**

**Case No. 17-MD-2804**

**Judge Dan Aaron Polster**

**JOINT STIPULATION AND ORDER**

Defendants UnitedHealth Group Incorporated; Optum, Inc.; OptumInsight, Inc.; OptumInsight Life Sciences, Inc.; OptumRx Discount Card Services, LLC; Optum Perks, LLC; OptumHealth Care Solutions, LLC; OptumHealth Holdings, LLC; and Optum Health Networks, Inc. (the “Optum Defendants”) intend to move to dismiss the Amended Complaints in Tracks 12–15 on jurisdictional and other grounds.<sup>1</sup>

Plaintiffs City of Rochester, New York; Lincoln County, Missouri; City of Independence, Missouri; and County of Webb, Texas have requested that the Optum Defendants respond to discovery requests in Tracks 12–15. The Optum Defendants have not done so to preserve all Rule 12

---

<sup>1</sup> Seven of those Defendants—OptumInsight, Inc.; OptumInsight Life Sciences, Inc.; OptumRx Discount Card Services, LLC; Optum Perks, LLC; OptumHealth Care Solutions, LLC; OptumHealth Holdings, LLC; and Optum Health Networks, Inc.—were not party to any of the four PBM Bellwether tracks before the Court’s February 20, 2024 Order on Plaintiffs’ motion for leave to amend.

and other defenses available to them, including defenses for lack of personal jurisdiction.

To preserve the Optum Defendants' jurisdictional and other defenses, Plaintiffs and the Optum Defendants stipulate as follows:

- Plaintiffs and the PEC agree that the Optum Defendants do not waive any jurisdictional or other defenses in any opioid litigation in this MDL by participating in discovery in the MDL or engaging in any other activities related to the MDL.
- Plaintiffs and the PEC agree that they will not argue that the Optum Defendants have waived any jurisdictional or other defenses in any opioid litigation in this MDL by participating in discovery in the MDL or engaging in any other activities related to the MDL.

Subject to the Court's adoption of this stipulation on the docket confirming that the Optum Defendants preserve all Rule 12 and other defenses available to them, including as to the Court's jurisdiction, the Optum Defendants agree to do the following by March 21, 2024:

1. Serve objections and responses to Plaintiffs' December 29, 2023 "Combined Discovery Requests" (1<sup>st</sup> Set),
2. Serve objections and responses to Plaintiffs' February 6, 2024 "National Data Requests,"
3. Serve objections and responses to Plaintiffs' February 6, 2024 "Geographic Specific Data Requests," and
4. Identify proposed search terms and custodians under the relevant case management orders for Tracks 12–15 (Dkt. 5282 and Dkt. 5295).

SO ORDERED.

Date: March 18, 2024

*s/Dan Aaron Polster*

The Honorable Dan A. Polster

U.S. District Judge for the Northern District of Ohio

Submitted: March 18, 2024

**Counsel for the Optum Defendants**

/s/ Brian Boone

ALSTON & BIRD LLP

Brian D. Boone

**ALSTON & BIRD LLP**

Bank of America Plaza, Suite 4000

101 S. Tryon St.

Charlotte, NC 28280

Tel: (704) 444-1000

brian.boone@alston.com

William H. Jordan

**ALSTON & BIRD LLP**

1201 West Peachtree Street NW, Suite 4900

Atlanta, GA 30309

Tel.: (404) 881-7000

bill.jordan@alston.com

caroline.strumph@alston.com

Kimberly K. Chemerinsky

**ALSTON & BIRD LLP**

333 South Hope Street, 16th Floor

Los Angeles, CA 90071-1410

Tel: (213) 576-1000

kim.chemerinsky@alston.com

ethan.bond@alston.com

**Plaintiffs' Co-Lead Counsel:**

/s/ Paul Farrell

Joe Rice

Linda Singer

**Motley Rice LLC**

28 Bridgeside Blvd.

Mount Pleasant, SC 29464

jrice@motleyrice.com

lsinger@motleyrice.com

Paul Farrell, Jr.

**FARRELL & FULLER**

1311 Ponce de Leone Ave. Suite 202

San Juan, PR 00907

paul@farrellfuller.com

Peter H. Weinberger

**SPANGENBERG SHIBLEY & LIBER**

1001 Lakeside Avenue East, Suite 1700

Cleveland, OH 44114

pweinberger@spanglaw.com

Jayne Conroy

Laura Fitzpatrick

**SIMMONS HANLY CONROY**

112 Madison Avenue, 7th Floor

New York, NY 10016

jconroy@simmonsfirm.com

lfitzpatrick@simmonsfirm.com

**Counsel for the City of Rochester, NY:**

/s/ Hunter Shkolnik

Hunter J. Shkolnik

Paul J. Napoli

**NSPR Law Services LLC**

1302 Avenida Ponce de Leon

Santurce, Puerto Rico 00907

hunter@nsprlaw.com

pnapoli@nsprlaw.com

Salvatore C. Badala

Shayna E. Sacks

Joseph L. Ciaccio

**Napoli Skholnik PLLC**

360 Lexington Avenue, 11<sup>th</sup> Floor  
New York, NY 10017  
sbadala@napolilaw.com  
ssacks@napolilaw.com  
jciaccio@napolilaw.com

**Counsel for Lincoln County, MO:**

*/s/ Joanne Cicala*

---

Joanne Cicala  
Joshua Wackerly  
R. Johan Conrod  
Shelbi Flood

**The Cicala Law Firm PLLC**

101 College Street  
Dripping Springs, TX 78620  
joanne@cicalapllc.com  
josh@cicalapllc.com  
johan@cicalapllc.com  
shelbi@cicalapllc.com

John F. Garvey  
Colleen Garvey  
Ellen A. Thomas

**Stranch, Jennings & Garvey, PLLC**

Peabody Plaza  
701 Market Street, Suite 1510  
St. Louis, MO 63101  
jgarvey@stranchlaw.com  
cgarvey@stranchlaw.com  
ethomas@stranchlaw.com

Patrick A. Hamacher  
Mark R. Niemeyer

**NIEMEYER, GREBEL & KRUSE, LLC**

211 N. Broadway, Suite 2950  
St. Louis, MO 63102  
Tel: (314) 241-1919  
Fax: (314) 665-3017  
hamacher@ngklawfirm.com  
Niemeyer@ngklawfirm.com

**Counsel for City of Independence, MO:**

*/s/ Joanne Cicala*

---

Joanne Cicala  
Joshua Wackerly

R. Johan Conrod  
Shelbi Flood  
**The Cicala Law Firm PLLC**  
101 College Street  
Dripping Springs, TX 78620  
joanne@cicalapllc.com  
josh@cicalapllc.com  
johan@cicalapllc.com  
shelbi@cicalapllc.com

John F. Garvey  
Colleen Garvey  
Ellen A. Thomas  
**Stranch, Jennings & Garvey, PLLC**  
Peabody Plaza  
701 Market Street, Suite 1510  
St. Louis, MO 63101  
jgarvey@stranchlaw.com  
cgarvey@stranchlaw.com  
ethomas@stranchlaw.com

Daniel A. Thomas  
**HUMPHREY FARRINGTON MCCLAIN**  
221 W. Lexington Ave. Ste 400  
Independence, MO 64050  
Tel: (816) 836-5050  
DAT@hfmlegal.com

**Counsel for County of Webb, TX:**

*/s/ Joanne Cicala*

---

Joanne Cicala  
Joshua Wackerly  
R. Johan Conrod  
Shelbi Flood  
**The Cicala Law Firm PLLC**  
101 College Street  
Dripping Springs, TX 78620  
joanne@cicalapllc.com  
josh@cicalapllc.com  
johan@cicalapllc.com  
shelbi@cicalapllc.com

Kevin Sharp  
Christine Dunn  
**SANFORD HEISLER SHARP, LLP**  
611 Commerce Street, Suite 3100  
Nashville, Tennessee 37203

Tel: (615) 434-7000

Fax: (615) 434-7020

ksharp@sanfordheisler.com

cdunn@sanfordheisler.com